



UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE
United States Patent and Trademark Office
Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450
www.uspto.gov

| APPLICATION NO. | FILING DATE | FIRST NAMED INVENTOR | ATTORNEY DOCKET NO. | CONFIRMATION NO. |
|--------------------|-------------|----------------------|---------------------|------------------|
| 10/586,098 | 03/20/2007 | Mikhail Laksin | S9025.0219 | 1736 |
| 63725 | 7590 | 12/06/2010 | | |
| DICKSTEIN SHAPIRO | | | | |
| 1633 Broadway | | | | |
| NEW YORK, NY 10019 | | | | |
| EXAMINER | | | | |
| SHAH, MANISH S | | | | |
| ART UNIT | | PAPER NUMBER | | |
| 2853 | | | | |
| MAIL DATE | | DELIVERY MODE | | |
| 12/06/2010 | | PAPER | | |

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

The time period for reply, if any, is set in the attached communication.

Response to Arguments

1. Applicant's arguments filed 11/18/2010 have been fully considered but they are not persuasive. Applicant argued that the Ylitalo discloses in [0080] that radiation curable ink composition is solvent free, which is not persuasive. However, at end of the paragraph [0080] they clearly teaches that "a small amount may be desirably under certain circumstances, in that case the amount of solvent is preferably not more than 20 percent". Applicant argued that the word "certain" is significant since it indicates the solvent may be desirable only under some circumstance, but Ylitalo never reveals what those circumstances constitute. However reference doesn't have to reveals what those circumstances are, disclosing in the specification at one time is good enough evidence. Therefore, Ylitalo discloses radiation curable ink is not solvent free.
2. Applicant argued that the both the secondary reference Knox and Tsuyoshi as ink composition containing a solvent soluble resin that provides image with good adhesion, this characteristic is wrong, which is not persuasive.
3. Examiner used the Knox reference, because it clearly discloses in column: 6, line: 45-67 that the organic binder media include those organic materials habitually employed as binders in inks. The binder can be solvent soluble resin. Therefore it is well known in the art that solvent soluble resin used in the ink composition, it doesn't matter it is energy curable ink or regular ink. Therefore it would have been obvious to use the solvent soluble resin taught by Knox in Ylitalo, and by doing this it improves the application property (column: 6, line: 65-67).

4. As an Examiner mention in Final rejection, Tsuyoshi clearly teaches that pigment ink composition comprises binder (which means that something used in binding) ([0038]-[0039]), therefore pigment based ink composition with binder material has good binding characteristics to the medium. Therefore, obviously Tsuyoshi's ink composition containing a solvent soluble resin that provides image with good adhesion characteristics.
5. Applicant in page 9 argued that the Knox reference does not even teach or suggest a printing ink, which is not persuasive, in Example 3 Knox clearly teaches that an aqueous printing ink was prepared and printed on paper. Therefore Knox teaches a printing ink.

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Manish S. Shah whose telephone number is (571) 272-2152. The examiner can normally be reached on 8:00am-4:30pm.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Stephen D. Meier can be reached on (571) 272-2149. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 571-273-8300.

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see <http://pair-direct.uspto.gov>. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free). If you would like assistance from a USPTO Customer Service Representative or access to the automated information system, call 800-786-9199 (IN USA OR CANADA) or 571-272-1000.

/Manish S. Shah/
Primary Examiner
Art Unit 2853

/MSS/